Effect of maternal post-partum depression on child cognitive development in boys and girls: A systematic review

Master’s Capstone Project

Nadine Ebeid

February 10, 2018

St. Luke’s Graduate School of Public Health

St. Luke’s International University
Abstract

Researchers have explored the relationship between maternal post-partum depression and cognitive development of the offspring, but the results remain inconclusive regarding the presence of a difference in effect based on the child’s gender. This study aims to assess the cumulative evidence from the current body of literature on the association between maternal post-partum depression and child cognitive development in boys and girls separately. A search for articles was performed through PubMed, The Cochrane Library, PsycInfo, and Embase, and was supplemented by manual search of the reference lists. Articles exploring the epidemiological association between maternal post-partum depression and cognitive development separately in boys and girls were included. Eight articles were considered eligible for this review; half of them focused on child cognitive development at the preschool age of 3-6 years, 2 articles for the age of 18 months, and 2 articles targeting older children (ages 11 and 16 years). Collective results show lower cognitive development especially among boys of post-partum depressed mothers, and particularly when associated with low social class. This finding appears consistent across all age groups. Further research that target representative populations from developing countries may be important considering the observed role of social class and overall higher rates of maternal depression in those regions.

Keywords: PPD, maternal depression, postpartum depression, postnatal depression, cognitive development, cognitive abilities, IQ, Intelligence.
Introduction

A child’s cognitive development during early childhood, which includes building skills such as pre-reading, language, vocabulary, and numeracy, begins from the moment a child is born. A child who has an impaired or delayed development of these skills is at risk of poor performance at school (White House Archives). Moreover, it has been noted that cognitive development at early ages has a significant effect on the individual’s health-seeking behaviors and consequently the individual’s health (Park et al. 2011).

Childhood developmental milestones and cognitive skills

Children progress through distinct periods of development as they age. In infancy, one of the first developmental milestones is marked by the ability to distinguish the five different senses during the first month of life. During the following two months, the child starts to recognize colors, differentiate between them, and gain control of muscles. At this stage, the child also develops the ability to express some emotions such as distress, delight and certain social skills such as smiling at people. From four to six months, the child can localize sounds, starts babbling, and distinguishes the mother. Starting from the seventh month, the motor development is distinctive, the child starts crawling and social skills are more developed; he/she may protest separation from the mother (Committee on the Science of Children Birth to Age 8, 2015; Staff, 2015). Later and with time, the child learns how to control all motor activities, how to express different emotions, starts obeying commands, learns how to speak effectively, and cognitive skills become well-developed.

The presence of a difference in the development of boys and girls remains debatable; Zambrana et al. (2012) concluded that boys develop language comprehension (LC) at a faster rate than girls between 18 and 36 months, but girls still remain superior in their level of
LC at 36 months of age. Barbu et al. (2011) suggests that girls develop social skills and structured forms of play at younger ages than boys. According to the American Academy of Pediatrics (AAP) girls are able to pay attention for longer periods of time and boys do better at visual tasks.

Cognitive skills are the core skills that the brain uses to think, learn, read, remember, reason, and pay attention. The cognitive development in early childhood is affected by genetic, biological, social, and psychological factors which may all be influenced by other factors such as poverty, cultural norms, and childrearing environments (Grantham-McGregor et al. 2007; Walker et al. 2011). The Adverse Childhood Experiences (ACE) study has shown that adverse childhood events including physical/ emotional/sexual abuse or neglect, substance abuse by the parents, violence against the mother and parental separation or divorce have an effect on the child health and social life. Those adverse childhood experiences may lead to delayed cognitive, social and emotional development, risky health behaviors, and the individual may be more prone to diseases, disabilities and social problems and even early death (Felitti et al.1998)

Maternal influence on child’s early development

Mothers play an important role in shaping the child’s cognitive development during the early milestones (Howard et al. 2011). Thus, the mother’s physical and mental health are thought to be important for the child’s cognitive development and well-being. The World Health Organization estimates that worldwide, about 10% of pregnant women and 13% of women who have just given birth experience a mental disorder, primarily depression. In developing countries, this is even higher in the range of about 15.6% during pregnancy and 19.8% after child birth, and there appears to be an increasing trend in rates (WHO, 2015). In severe cases, the mothers’ suffering may be very extreme leading her to commit suicide (WHO, 2015; CDC, 2017). The rates are
Post-partum depression and child cognitive development

higher in the less developed countries owing to poverty, migration, extreme stress, and exposure to violence.

Symptoms may start as post-partum blues that usually resolves spontaneously, but in 5% of cases they may transition into post-partum depression that requires medical treatment. Women suffering from post-partum depression might develop hallucinations or even suicidal ideation (Pearlstein et al. 2009).

Maternal depressive symptoms are negatively associated with early child development and quality of parenting across different cultures and socioeconomic groups (Wachs et al. 2009). Mothers largely influence infants’ social environment and mediate their experiences with the external world; thus, maternal responsiveness and sensitivity are recognized to be major factors that shape cognitive and socioemotional competence in children (Walker et al. 2007). This problem is present in high-income as well as in middle- and low-income countries; in Bangladesh, maternal depressive symptoms were associated with infant stunting, perhaps owing to unresponsive caregiving (Black et al. 2009).

Purpose of this systematic review

The consequences of maternal post-partum depression on child development do not stop at infancy, but can extend into school age and the effects may be different by the child’s gender. Significant adverse effects of post-partum depression on the intelligence quotient (IQ) of the offspring at the age of 16, particularly among boys, were observed (Hay et al. 2008). Few other studies have evaluated the effects of maternal depression on the cognitive development in boys and girls separately. The lines of evidence available that address gender as a factor influencing the effects of maternal depression on child development have shown some inconsistency. Sharp et al. (1995) found that the mean score of the general cognitive function measure was one
standard deviation lower in boys of post-partum depressed mothers than in the boys of well mothers. Murray (1992) found that post-partum depression had no effect on infant cognitive development, but did show an influence on boys and socioeconomically deprived children in terms of vulnerability.

Taken together, while the evidence does seem to point towards a real association between maternal post-partum depression and childhood cognitive development in general (Liu et al. 2017), less is known about its potential heterogeneity in effect by gender, and a synthesis of the collective evidence has not yet been performed. Thus, we conducted a systematic review with the objective to comprehensively assess the current available evidence examining the effect of maternal post-partum depression on child cognitive development by gender of the child.

Methods

Literature search strategy

A systematic review of current epidemiological studies was performed according to the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guidelines. We retrieved articles from various databases including PubMed, The Cochrane Library, PsycInfo, and Embase from inception of the database until the present; the last search was performed on October 16, 2017. The following search terms were used for the identification of articles:

“post-partum depression” or “postpartum depression” or “post-natal depression” or “postnatal depression” or “maternal AND depression” or “mother AND depression”. AND
“cognitive ability” or “intelligence quotient” or “child AND cognition AND Intelligence”
or “child AND cognitive AND Impairment” or “child AND cognitive AND ability”

All keywords were searched using the free text term and MeSH terms. In addition, a manual screening of the reference list of the most relevant articles was performed to potentially identify additional studies.

Inclusion and exclusion criteria

The inclusion and exclusion criteria were specified in advance in the study protocol. Articles with maternal post-partum depression as the primary exposure and child cognitive development as the primary outcome were included. For child age, no limitations were applied as we sought to understand the effect of maternal depression on cognitive development in different age groups. All types of epidemiological study designs were considered.

The search was limited to studies published in English due to the inability to translate articles published in foreign languages. Primary exposures such as anxiety or other psychiatric conditions, and articles with unclear or unstated ethical approval were excluded. Studies that did not mention the effects of maternal depression on boys and girls separately were also excluded.

Study selection and data extraction

Studies were selected using a three step process. First, a primary screening by title and abstract of the retrieved articles was conducted. Second, the full texts of the studies selected in the first step screening were read and those that met the inclusion criteria were identified. Third, a final selection step was carried out by reviewing the references of the selected articles to identify relevant articles that were not captured by the systematic screening. Only published articles were included due to the inaccessibility to unpublished articles.
Quality of the selected studies was assessed using the “Newcastle-Ottawa Quality Assessment Form for Cohort Studies” (Wells et al. 2011). This form consists of eight items that evaluate the selection of the cohort, comparability, and assessment of the outcome of interest. This form was selected for the evaluation of the articles as the final selected studies were all longitudinal cohort studies. The quality of the study was used to evaluate the potential influence of study heterogeneity, and was not used as a criterion for exclusion.

For each of the included studies, the following information were extracted: the presence of maternal post-partum depression, mean age of the mother during the post-partum period, mother’s education, mother’s IQ, marital status and home environment, social class, child birth weight at time of delivery, child sex, child mean age at time of the study, child’s mean cognitive scores and if the child was breastfed.

**Synthesis of collective evidence**

Due to the variation in measurement tools and other sources of heterogeneity across studies, a meta-analysis was not performed. Instead, included studies were evaluated qualitatively by grouping the studies by age categories of the child. A focus was placed on the pre-school/school age as this group had the most number of studies available for assessment. Additionally, the consistency of evidence was evaluated in the context of various sources of heterogeneity including the effect of maternal IQ, and the social class or maternal education.

**Results**

The searched terms retrieved 247 articles from PubMed, 472 from Embase, 177 from the Cochrane Library and 1499 from PsycInfo. One additional relevant study was found through manual search (Azak 2012). Ninety-four potentially relevant articles were identified by primary
screening of the title and abstract. Among these, 8 articles met the pre-defined criteria for inclusion (Figure 1).

As shown in Table 1, included studies were conducted in 4 European countries: 5 studies from the United Kingdom (Murray 1992, Murray et al. 1996, Hay 2001, Murray et al. 2010 and Sharp et al. 1995), 1 study from the Netherlands (Kersten-Alvarez et al. 2012), 1 study from France (Waerden et al. 2016) and 1 study from Norway (Azak et al. 2012). All of these studies used longitudinal cohort designs among which maternal depressive symptoms were assessed during the last trimester and first year post-partum and at least 6 months prior to the assessment of the child cognitive development. The duration of follow-up of the cohorts varied and ranged from 2 years to 16 years.
Figure 1: Flow diagram of study identification and selection
Post-partum depression and child cognitive development

Table 1: Summary and characteristics of included studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author and year</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number of participants</th>
<th>Assessment of maternal depression</th>
<th>Assessment of child cognitive development</th>
<th>Child age at the time of assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Waerden et al. (2016)</td>
<td>France</td>
<td>1039</td>
<td>CES-D and EPDS</td>
<td>WPPSI-III (VIQ/PIQ/FSIQ)</td>
<td>5- 6 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azak (2012)</td>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>CES-D and DSM IV</td>
<td>MSEL</td>
<td>6- 12- 18 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kersten-Alvarez et al. (2012)</td>
<td>The Netherlands</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>DSM IV and Becks depression inventory</td>
<td>PPVT-R (Verbal intelligence)</td>
<td>5-6 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Murray et al. (2010)</td>
<td>U.K</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>EPDS</td>
<td>GSCE score</td>
<td>16 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Murray et al. (1996)</td>
<td>Cambridge, U.K</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>EPDS and SPI</td>
<td>McCarthy scale</td>
<td>5-6 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharp et al. (1995)</td>
<td>S.E London, U.K</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>CIS and ICD9</td>
<td>McCarthy scale</td>
<td>3 years and 10 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Murray (1992)</td>
<td>Cambridge, U.K</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>EPDS and SPI</td>
<td>BSMD and Reynell scales</td>
<td>18 months</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Measures of cognitive development in children

For child cognitive development, the outcome was based on the estimated mean and standard deviation of the cognitive and IQ scores and differences were compared across groups. Scales for measuring the cognitive development varied according to the children’s age. For infants, *Mullen Scales of Early Learning* (MSEL) and *Bailey Scale for Mental Development* (BSMD) were the...
main tools used to calculate the cognitive development scores. *Wechsler Preschool and Primary Scale of Intelligence, 3rd edition* (WPPSI-III), *McCarthy Scales for Children Abilities* and *The Peabody Picture Vocabulary Test (PPVT-R)* were used for children aged 5 to 8 years old. One study measured intelligence at the age of 11 years using *Wechsler Intelligence Scale for Children, 3rd edition* (WISC III) and lastly, at the age of 16 years, *General Certificate of Secondary Education* (GCSE) scores were compared between students.

*Measures for the detection of post-partum depression*

For the detection of post-partum depression, the *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders, 4th Edition* (DVM-IV) criteria, *International Statistical Classification of Diseases and Related Health Problems* (ICD9), *Clinical Interview Schedule* (CIS), the *Standard Psychiatric Interview* (SPI), the *Center for Epidemiological Studies-Depression* (CES-D), and the *Edinburgh Postnatal Depression Scale* (EPDS) were used. Most of the selected studies used two scales to diagnose post-partum depression. The mean score and standard deviation obtained from these scales were calculated and used to separate depressed and non-depressed mothers into two different groups.

*Effect in pre-school and elementary school aged children*

Table 2 shows select characteristics of the four included studies that addressed the child cognitive development considering the gender differences at the pre-school and elementary school age (Sharp et al. 1995; Murray et al. 1996; Kersten-Alvarez et al. 2012 and Waerden et al. 2016).
Table 2: Characteristics of studies included for the pre-school/school age groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not postpartum-depressed</td>
<td>Education level A (more than 12 years)</td>
<td>Scale: 0-5</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>All levels of education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Post-Partum depressed</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>47% education level A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All social classes</td>
<td>Rural and urban areas</td>
<td>65% upper to middle social class</td>
<td>Low socioeconomic environment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WPPSI-III (VIQ/PIQ/FSIQ)</td>
<td>PPVT-R (Verbal Intelligence)</td>
<td>McCarthy Scale (Verbal ability/ GCI)</td>
<td>McCarthy Scale (Verbal ability/ GCI)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Abbreviations: GCI, General Cognition Index; Education level A: more than 12 years of school education; FSIQ, Full Scale IQ; PIQ, Performance IQ; PPVT-R, the Peabody Picture and Vocabulary Test-Revised Edition; VIQ, Verbal IQ; WPPSI-III, Wechsler Preschool and Primary Scale of Intelligence 3rd edition.

Sharp et al. (1995) and Murray et al. (1996) used the McCarthy scale to measure the child cognitive development at the age of 5-6 years. The scale measures the intellectual abilities including: verbal ability, perceptual ability, quantitative ability, memory, and motor ability, also providing a score for General Cognitive Index (GCI). It is one of the first tools developed for this purpose and has been shown to be valid and highly reliable which makes it competitive with the WPPSI test used by Waerden et al. (2016). WPPSI measures the verbal IQ (VIQ), performance IQ (PIQ), full scale IQ (FSIQ), processing speed (PSQ), and General Language Composite (GLC) (Bryant et al. 1978; Phillips et al. 1978; Community-University Partnership for the Study of Children, Youth, and Families 2011).
Table 3: McCarthy General Cognition Index in pre-school and elementary school age children by gender (and mothers’ social class for Murray 1996) for Murray (1996) and Sharp (1995) (Means and Standard Deviation)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social class</th>
<th>Murray et al. 1996</th>
<th>Sharp et al. 1995</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I,II,III (non-manual)</td>
<td>III (manual), IV, V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control group</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boys</td>
<td>116.7 (14.7)a</td>
<td>109.9 (11.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girls</td>
<td>113.6 (8.9)</td>
<td>106.8 (3.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children of post-partum depressed mothers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boys</td>
<td>112.0 (10.9)</td>
<td>104.7 (14.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girls</td>
<td>116.0 (12.6)</td>
<td>104.7 (8.3)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*a Mean and standard deviation of cognitive development scores

Table 3 presents the results of two studies that used same measures of cognitive development in children of similar age. Murray et al. (1996) concluded that maternal depression alone is not associated with the cognitive development at the age of 5. Maternal post-partum depression has an effect only when associated with low social class. Post-partum depression and low social class may contribute to low cognitive scores, particularly in boys of depressed mothers which make them more vulnerable. The findings of this study are consistent with the findings of Sharp et al. (1995) - conducted in a socioeconomically deprived area in Southeast London- which showed that there is a significant cognitive impairment among boys of post-partum depressed mothers.

Both studies had very small sample sizes that did not appear to represent the whole population. Sharp et al. (1995) was representing an economically deprived area of Southeast London, and Murray et al. (1996) represented an area of better living conditions around the catchment of a hospital in Cambridge. Yet, both studies had similar results showing that boys of post-partum depressed mothers of low social class may be more vulnerable and have lower cognitive scores. In contrast, Hay et al. (1995) found, in a North London sample, that there is no
difference in the effect of maternal depression on the child development based on gender; however this study did not show the cognitive scores of boys and girls separately, hence, it was not included in the analysis. Furthermore, North London has better socioeconomic status than South London, which supports the hypothesis that social class may play a role in low cognitive development. The difference of effect across genders may be attributed to the influence of social class more than the maternal depression itself.

Waerden et al. (2016) found that post-partum depression has an effect on child cognitive development. This effect is more evident with persistent depression; the longer the depression persists, the poorer the child cognitive outcomes. Boys and not girls of persistent post-partum depressed mothers have low PIQ and FSIQ, but not VIQ. VIQ scores were within the normal range. Furthermore, no association between socioeconomic status and child cognitive development was found. The normal VIQ in boys in the Waerden et al. (2016) study is consistent with the finding of Kersten-Alvarez et al. (2012) which pointed out that boys have a normal VIQ; however, girls have lower verbal intelligence according to the PPVT-R test when exposed to maternal post-partum depression.

All studies excluded children born with low birth weight and adjusted for breast-feeding. Maternal IQ was a covariate in all included studies except the Waerden et al. (2016) study. Yet, after adjusting for it in all studies where it is included, the final association between maternal post-partum depression and cognitive development did not alter the interpretation.
Post-partum depression and child cognitive development

Effect in infants and children up to two years of age

Table 4: The cognitive development scores in boys and girls at age of 18 months.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>On Reynell Scales</td>
<td>On MSEL Scales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sample Size</td>
<td>MSS Estimate (SE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control group</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boys</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>-0.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girls</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>0.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children of post-partum</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>depressed mothers</td>
<td>Boys</td>
<td>-0.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Girls</td>
<td>0.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>19</td>
<td>1.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.42</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Abbreviations: MSS, Mean Standard Score

To assess the effect of post-partum depression on children during the first two years of life, Azak (2012) used the MSEL scale (Table 4). Nearly all depressed mothers in this sample were from high socioeconomic class, with more than 50% of the mothers well-educated with at least a master’s degree and were under treatment during follow-up for their post-partum depression. The majority of the depressed mothers (80%) reported being mentally ill during pregnancy. Additionally, they noted low parenting styles. MSEL was negatively correlated with maternal education, showing that mothers with higher education may experience less stresses in life and their children may have better cognitive trajectories. It is possible that the mental illness of the mothers during pregnancy could have affected the results. Girls showed faster rates of increasing MSEL scores (estimate: 0.12, S.E:0.42) over time compared to boys. This finding is consistent with other studies showing that female infants reach milestones earlier than boys (Diamond 1995, Kotovosky et al.1998 and Ozçaliskan et al. 2010). Thus the relationship between the
maternal post-partum depression and cognitive development according to gender could be confounded by this natural course of development in this age group.

Murray (1992) observed that low scores on the scales of mental development in this sample was associated with post-partum depression only in the context of low socioeconomic class and that boys are more affected than girls. A meta-analysis in this age group that did not stratify by gender (Liu et al. 2017) concluded the presence of an association between maternal post-partum depression and children development.

**Effect in older children**

Two studies were available for this age group (Table 5). Hay *et al.* (2001) measured the cognitive development at the age of 11 years by using the WISC-III scale. This study showed that post-partum depression may have an effect on the educational needs in children. Boys were more affected than girls in which the gender difference was more pronounced based on PIQ.

Murray *et al.* (2010) measured the cognitive development by assessing the GSCE scores of children of post-partum depressed mothers and a community sample of non-depressed mothers. They concluded that the boys’ cognitive development is more affected by the maternal postpartum depression, as a continuation of the post-partum effect on earlier cognitive development.
Table 5: Summary of results of the studies included for the older age groups.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not depressed</td>
<td>Post-partum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>mothers (Mean Score)</td>
<td>mothers (Mean Score)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boys</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FSIQ</td>
<td>103.2</td>
<td>83.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIQ</td>
<td>102.6</td>
<td>88.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PIQ</td>
<td>103.1</td>
<td>82.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girls</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FSIQ</td>
<td>97.6</td>
<td>93.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIQ</td>
<td>98.3</td>
<td>92.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PIQ</td>
<td>97.4</td>
<td>97.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Abbreviations: FSIQ, Full Scale IQ; GCSE, General Certificate of secondary education; PIQ, Performance IQ; VIQ, Verbal IQ.

Discussion

Our review of the eight studies that focused on the effects of post-partum depression on cognitive development of boys and girls separately revealed that the maternal well-being is extremely important during the first year after delivery. Infants of post-partum depressed mothers showed a delayed cognitive development compared to infants of non-depressed mothers. This association was more evident in boys from families of low social class. This observation may be explained by a tendency for greater attachment of the mother to the daughter in early life; post-partum depressed mothers may treat girls and boys differently. At an older age when the child reaches the preschool/elementary school period, the effect of post-partum depression is only observed among those living in low social classes and underprivileged societies. Maternal and paternal intelligence did not influence the cognitive development of the child at that age. Reaching the age of 11 and 16 years, the effect of post-partum depression continues to play a role on child cognition particularly in boys. Alternatively, personality traits and self-discipline
may apply more to girls and may account for the relatively poor prediction of their academic achievement from cognitive ability (Else-Quest et al. 2006, Duckworth et al. 2006). Based on the synthesis of the published literature to date, the evidence appears to suggest a significant role for social class and maternal mental state in influencing cognitive development of the child.

By examining the ability of the individual to adapt to adverse conditions, Sun et al. (2012) observed that in primary school children, girls have more psychosocial resilience than boys, which is consistent with the results of our study. However, psychosocial resilience could change in different genders over time and based on the environment where the individual lives. Bonanno et al. (2007) and Masood et al. (2016) concluded that in adults, women have less likelihood of resilience in stressful events, and Boardman et al. (2008) examined the heritability of psychological resilience among US adults aged 25 to 74 years showing that men have more psychological resilience.

Sources of study heterogeneity

Our study reviewed all the available evidence derived from epidemiological studies addressing the influence of maternal post-partum depression on the cognitive development of boys and girls at a range of ages. To our knowledge, this is the first review to summarize the evidence specifically by gender. However, this review should be interpreted in the context of certain limitations. For examining the association in infants, only two studies were available that examined the relationship by gender, and they were conducted in populations of specific social class and across different countries. This is a source of heterogeneity that may limit the generalizability of the findings, yet the results showed consistency. The sample size of both
studies was relatively small, which might have contributed to random variation and chance findings. However, consistency in results across studies argues in favor of a true association.

For the preschool and elementary school age population, different measurements were used to assess the mother’s depression and the cognitive development. All scales are recognized to have high validity and reliability, except for the PPVT-R test which has lower reliability than the McCarthy scale and the WPPSI-III. Weschler scales (WPPSI, WISC-III and WAIS) have a more rigid construct validity compared to the McCarthy scale, yet, according to Hedlund (1977) both McCarthy and Wechsler scales correlate well with each other except for measurements on motor ability, a characteristics not examined in our study. Moreover, Kersten-Alvarez et al. (2012), which used the PPVT-R test was scored as being a lower quality study based on the “Newcastle-Ottawa Quality Assessment Form for Cohort Studies”. Despite this, the result of this study showed consistency with findings from the other studies. Different measurement scales could be a source of information bias, but we would expect the bias to be a non-differential in nature. Despite of the presence of this non-differential bias, the associations were detected and appeared consistent across studies.

There was variation in the combination of confounders addressed in each study including breastfeeding, low birth weight, social class, mother education, mother IQ, father IQ, parental relationship status and nutritional status. All studies appropriately excluded children born with low birth weight. There is an established association between low birth weight and delayed infant development in early life (Lee et al. 1993; Hack et al. 1995; Tong et al. 2006). The main covariate that most studies focused on was social class. Studies conducted exclusively in high social class populations did not observe an association between maternal depression and the child’s cognitive development. In contrast, those performed in populations of lower social
class observed associations. The quality scores of both studies representing high and low social classes generally indicated they were of high quality which makes it unlikely that the results can be explained completely by a major bias. This consistency of the association was present among all populations, which supports the presence of an association by gender.

It is also important to acknowledge that all studies were not performed over the same time period. Sharp et al. (1995) was in the nineties and Waerden et al. (2016) targeted a more recent population. This difference is accompanied by differences in the general surrounding environment and living conditions. Also, treatment options for maternal depression have improved over time. Despite these potential sources of heterogeneity, overall, the results appeared to still show marked consistency.

Generalizability of the findings

Sample sizes in all studies – except Waerdan et al. (2016) - were relatively small and may not be representative of the broader population. The identified role of social class in influencing the relationship between maternal post-partum depression and child’s cognitive development differently in boys and girls suggests that the causal mechanisms are likely complex and that different mechanisms may be at play depending on the subpopulation. Populations for five of the eight studies appear to be homogenous, that is, from the same ethnicity, in the same city and having the same cultural background. Studies were limited to populations from European countries, and no articles mentioning gender differences were available from the USA or developing countries. If studies were conducted in other populations, results might not be the same. For example, in African countries, nutrition plays an important role in child development; the rates of infectious diseases are higher and socio-cultures bonds are tighter. Furthermore,
gender inequality is prevalent in many developing societies, leading to more care for boys than girls which might in turn leads to better cognitive outcomes for boys.

**Interventions**

In order to address this problem, we have to focus on treating and preventing the maternal post-partum depression. Several researchers have attempted to explore this area and provide suggestions for prevention or early treatment. Beck (1996) suggested that the mother and the infant are a dyad, since difficult infant temperament might be a cause for the maternal post-partum depression; and the best way to move forward is to focus on both of them. Symon et al. (2005) concluded that sleep interventions can help change the parental behavior and may improve the infant’s sleep. This might help in reducing the maternal post-partum depression.

Another intervention is the Interpersonal Therapy (IPT), which is a short term psychotherapy, originally designed for major depressive disorders and later adapted to treat women in the post-partum period (Spinelli et al. 2003). Also, the ROSE program (Reach-Out, Stay strong, Essentials for new mothers) which is a manualized IPT-based group intervention to help pregnant women on public assistance improve and build closer relationships and support networks (Zlotnick et al. 2016).

Regular prenatal care is very important to detect antepartum and post-partum depression and treat them as early as possible. Reducing the prevalence of post-partum depression may have a significant public health impact leading to better maternal and child health.
Conclusion

Between 1995 and 2016, eight independent cohort studies were conducted, and addressed the gender differences in the association between maternal post-partum depression and cognitive development in children. Overall, the cumulative evidence to date suggests that boys’ cognitive development are more affected than girls’ cognitive development when exposed to the post-partum depression in low social class areas. Among populations of high social class, the effect of the post-partum depression on cognitive development does not appear to be difference in boys and girls.

Given these results, there is a need for future studies to pursue gender-specific evaluation of this association in other regions of the world, especially in middle and low income countries where levels of maternal depression are higher.
References

American Academy of Pediatrics, Daughters. Retrieved February 04, 2018, from
https://www.healthychildren.org/English/family-life/family-dynamics/Pages/Daughters.aspx

American Academy of Pediatrics, Sons. Retrieved February 04, 2018, from
https://www.healthychildren.org/English/family-life/family-dynamics/Pages/Sons.aspx

doi:10.1016/j.infbeh.2012.07.017 [doi]


Post-partum depression and child cognitive development


Post-partum depression and child cognitive development


Post-partum depression and child cognitive development


Maternal mental health. Retrieved January 17, 2018, from


Post-partum depression and child cognitive development


